

Willie R. Williams

Chief of Police (Retired)



August 20, 2014

Dr. Penny Rue
Vice President for campus Life
1834 Wake Forest Road
Winston-Salem, N. C. 27106

Dear Dr. Rue:

Thank you for the opportunity to be of assistance to Wake Forest University. As you are aware, Chief Tom Moss (Ret.) and I conducted an investigation of allegations of racial bias against members of the Wake Forest University Police Department. As a part of our investigation, we interviewed numerous students, University administrators, University Police personnel, and others. An analysis of various documents and written information was also completed.

The results of our investigation show that none of the allegations of racial bias rose to the level of actual bias. Nonetheless, we believe that many of the allegations could be perceived by students as evidence of such.

Below you will find a more detailed summary of our investigation. In addition, we have included arrest statistics that were analyzed. Notably, our analysis showed that there was no bias on the part of the Wake Forest University Police as it pertains to the issue of race in arrest situations. Finally, we have included our recommendations for the University's consideration. It was apparent to us that training and accountability are issues the University will need to address in order to help solve some of the issues of concern noted by the minority students.

If you have any questions about this information, or if we can be of any additional assistance, please contact us.

Best regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Willie R. Williams".

Chief Willie Williams (Ret.)
Developmental Associates

*4603 St. George's Drive
Wilson, N.C. 27896
Phone: (252) 290-2394
E-mail: wwilliams@myglnc.com*

Executive Summary

Chief Willie Williams (Ret.) and Chief Tom Moss (Ret.) conducted an investigation of allegations of racial bias against members of the Wake Forest University Police Department. The allegations arose during a Town Hall meeting conducted by students on March 6, 2014. The primary purpose of the meeting was to provide a forum for students to voice their frustration and displeasure with Wake Forest University Campus Police (WFUCP) and to bring about awareness to police administrators and school officials of allegations of unprofessional behavior and police tactics exhibited by WFUCP during a January 24, 2014 event at Reynolds Gymnasium. Minority students, many who attended the forum, voiced concerns that WFUCP used poor judgment and many of their police practices and tactics were racially motivated.

Chief Regina Lawson and other WFU staff were asked to serve as a panel to respond to a prepared set of questions pertaining to student life and police tactics. Students lined up at the microphone – mostly minority students – and spoke on differences in treatment of the minority and non-minority students. Some students indicated they were personally singled out and treated like second class-students because they were minority. Most students who submitted testimony stated they have never had a bad experience with the police. They spoke out because a friend or acquaintance reported that they had unprofessional interactions with WFUCP.

The investigative team (Chiefs Williams and Moss) interviewed numerous students, University administrators, University police personnel, representatives of the Winston-Salem Police Department (Chief of Police and District Commander) and the Winston-Salem State University Chief of Police. We also analyzed internal affairs complaint reports, arrest statistics, and written statements provided by students.

The investigation showed that many of the allegations could be perceived by the students as evidence of racial bias. However, none of the allegations rose to the level of actual racial bias. There were some incidents of insensitivity on the part of a limited number of police personnel. We found some differences in the way the National Pan-Hellenic Council (NPHC) and the Interfraternity Council (IFC) Greek organizations are viewed and treated by the University. However, the differences are explained by non-racial factors. It is clear from our investigation that students of color feel that the perceived bias pertains to their treatment by the entire University, not just limited to the police department.

Our recommendations center on providing additional training to University police personnel in the area of conscious and unconscious bias and cultural differences. Enhancing the number of

minority personnel in the police department must be a priority. Review the Large Social Event Management Guidelines and consider providing adult supervision for IFC social events on campus.

Additional Findings

Internal Affairs Investigations

A comprehensive study of all internal affairs investigations did not show a pattern of racial bias by members of the Police Department. This study included 2009 through April of 2014. The chart below reflects a breakdown of complaints by year, nature of complaints and number of personnel involved.

Year	Number of Complaints	Number of Personnel Involved
2009	8	11
2010	12	12
2011	8	10
2012	8	12
2013	15	26
2014	10	14

Race as a Factor in Arrests

We looked carefully at the race of arrestees at Wake Forest University in comparison to other North Carolina institutions and communities. We also compared arrests made by members of the Wake Forest University Police Department in relation to the State and National averages. It is apparent that the race of arrestees by the WFUPD is in accord with other organizations and we see no bias as it pertains to the issue of race in arrest situations.

Institution	Arrests in 2012*		
	Percent of Caucasian Arrests	Percent of African American Arrests	Percent of Other Ethnicity Arrests
Appalachian State University	93.8	5.4	0.8
Asheville City	67.1	32.2	0.7
Boone City	92.4	7.3	0.3
Chapel Hill City	56.7	40.8	2.5
Charlotte-Mecklenburg City	27.7	71.5	0.8
Duke University	32.1	66.1	1.8
Durham City	20.4	79.0	0.6
East Carolina University	64.6	34.7	0.7
Elizabeth City State	31.4	68.3	0.3
Elizabeth City State University	0.0	100.0	0.0
Elon City	76.4	22.5	1.1

Elon University	82.4	17.6	0.0
Fayetteville City	28.2	69.0	2.8
Fayetteville State University	0.0	100.0	0.0
Greensboro City	29.4	69.5	1.1
Greenville City	28.4	71.0	0.6
North Carolina - All	51.9	45.8	2.3
NC A&T University	3.7	96.3	0.0
NC Central University	2.8	97.2	0.0
NC State University	46.8	40.4	12.8
Raleigh City	33.4	65.4	1.2
UNC Asheville	83.3	16.7	0.0
UNC Chapel Hill	67.5	29.3	3.2
UNC Greensboro	57.0	41.1	1.9
UNC Charlotte	0.0	0.0	0.0
UNC Pembroke	20.2	47.2	32.6
UNC School of the Arts	0.0	0.0	0.0
UNC Wilmington	77.9	18.1	4.0
Unites States – All	69.3	28.1	2.6
United States – Cities	67.0	30.3	2.7
Wake Forest University PD	83.3	16.7	0.0
Western Carolina University	90.7	8.2	1.1
Wilmington City	50.6	49.0	0.4
Winston-Salem City	40.4	59.4	0.2
Winston-Salem State University	0.0	100.0	0.0

*2012 statistics were used because this is the latest year that full year stats were available on NC and Federal Uniform Crime Statistics Reports

Nationally, African Americans are arrested in greater percentages (as a percentage of their representation in the general population) than Caucasians. This is a fact that is borne out by the above table. One cannot assume that racial bias at Wake Forest University is a factor in arrests by campus police officers. One student indicated during his interview that he felt that the arrests of African Americans in larger percentages than the racial breakdown of students on campus was proof of racial bias by the police. This is not the case, and we cannot make any assumptions about racial bias by police based solely on arrest statistics.

Chief Lawson provided the investigative team arrest statistics for multiple years that broke arrests down by ethnicity and gender going back to the 2007-08 academic year. The following tables reflect arrests of Students and Non-Students on campus at Wake Forest University.

Arrests in 2007-08 to 2013-14 Academic Years – Arrests (Students & Non-Students)			
Gender/Ethnicity	Number	Percentage	Total by Race
Caucasian Male	76	58.5%	
Caucasian Female	13	10.0%	All Caucasian: 68.5%
African-American Male	37	28.5%	
African-American Female	4	3.0%	All African-American: 31.5%
Total	130		

Arrests in 2007-08 to 2013-14 Academic Years – Arrests (Students Only)			
Gender/Ethnicity	Number	Percentage	Total by Race
Caucasian Male	40	58.8%	
Caucasian Female	12	17.6%	All Caucasian: 76.5%
African-American Male	14	20.6%	
African-American Female	2	3.0%	All African-American: 23.5%
Total	68		

Arrests in 2007-08 to 2013-14 Academic Years – Arrests (Non-Students Only)			
Gender/Ethnicity	Number	Percentage	Total by Race
Caucasian Male	36	58.1%	
Caucasian Female	1	1.6%	All Caucasian: 59.7%
African-American Male	23	37.1%	
African-American Female	2	3.2%	All African-American: 40.3%
Total	62		

As mentioned above, it is evident that arrests of minority students are generally in larger percentages than they are represented on campus at Wake Forest. However, these numbers are clearly in accord with State and National trends and minorities appear to be arrested far less frequently at Wake Forest University than other institutions and entities.

In addition, based on 2011 numbers supplied by the Wake Forest University Police Department, Caucasians are represented in much greater percentages in terms of Field Contacts/Trespass Warnings and Traffic Stops involving University Police.

Recommendations

It is obvious to the investigators that training and accountability are large factors in solving some of the issues noted by minority students. Developmental Associates recommends the following related to cultural diversity and increased sensitivity:

- Provide culturally diverse and bias-based training programs for each employee at Wake Forest University Police Department. This training program should include unconscious and conscious biases. Wake Forest University has one such program on campus taught by a faculty member who is the Manager in the Office of Diversity. This program should be mandatory and ongoing. The investigation also uncovered similar diversity training on the campus of Winston-Salem State University. This investigation has focused mostly on the WFUPD; however, many persons interviewed felt that other University departments should be required to take this training as well.
- Encourage the officers to communicate respectfully and disengage when the police action is less than positive. To disengage, officers should be more responsive to students asking questions or seeking information. This helps to maintain respect and breeds good will as opposed to having the attitude of “why question me because I am an authority figure”. This is important in creating a courteous and respectful experience for both parties.
- Set a goal with specific timetables and metrics to develop innovative approaches to recruitment and take immediate action to hire additional minorities on the police force. Building a more diverse workforce is a strategy that will benefit the entire University. Hiring veteran officers can be beneficial and an asset to the University. However, care should be taken to make sure the officers’ experience is one of inclusiveness and professionalism. Targeted recruitment of African-American and Latino officers and employees is strongly recommended. The Human Resources Department can be a great asset in identifying appropriate personnel.
- The use of lounges on campus versus using a large venue has generated much discussion. Activities at the lounges sometimes result in unsupervised parties thus creating an opportunity for heavy and underage drinking. Therefore, we recommend that the administration review this procedure to make sure that all student events are policed in an equal manner. The events held by NPHC organizations are small and they cannot generally meet the required financial responsibility. Additionally, consider reviewing and possibly updating the Large Social Event Management Guidelines. Make sure the students are familiar with the guidelines and have some input since they directly impact them. The students have to agree and be held accountable for not exceeding the capacity limits. Adults and police should play a major role in the decision

of assigning students to tasks that may be better managed by an adult. This has been a major cause of confusion during events held by NPHC organizations. If a certain number of students leave an event and if capacity has been met, additional students should not be allowed to enter to fill the gap. When capacity is met, that should be the final count whether someone vacates the premises or not. Only the exact number of tickets should be sold to accommodate the capacity limit. Event sponsors should have a mechanism available to determine the authenticity of tickets that have been sold which should eliminate capacity surplus.

- Developmental Associates further recommends that the University and Campus Police re-institute the major event committee. The purpose of this committee is to communicate with all parties involved and should be held at least 7 days prior to the event. A detailed written action plan should be completed and discussed during this meeting. This action plan must address personnel assignments, cost and at least a Sergeant in charge. The Chief of Police or her designee needs to attend this briefing. This meeting does not counter the meeting officers have 30 minutes prior to the event. Corporals are not part of management. They are aligned more closely with field personnel as opposed to management. Officer in Charge of major events should carry at least the rank of Sergeant.
- It became clear to the investigators that there is disconnect between the wishes of senior police officials and the way those wishes are administered on night shift. Based on comments made by supervisors who work predominately at night, they do not necessarily view themselves as part of management. This can cause problems as these Corporals are managing the department at night and on weekends. Police Administration must work to include Corporals in management decision-making and to foster a greater sense of management responsibility among the night shift supervisors.
- Communication between the University and Campus Police needs to improve. The Chief of Police and senior staff must open up lines of communication through more Town Hall meetings, Chats with the Chief and other open forums. In addition, it is strongly recommended that Chief of Police hold mandatory quarterly meetings with the entire Police Department. These meetings will provide opportunities to keep the organization philosophy and goals out front and help address potential problems.